The Manager Leader Debate on Twitter
A textual thematic analysis

Authors: Dr. Julia Haber and Shea Coburn
Date: October 23, 2015
I do not have an affiliation (financial or otherwise) with a pharmaceutical, medical device or communications organization.

Je n’ai aucune affiliation (financière ou autre) avec une entreprise pharmaceutique, un fabricant d’appareils médicaux ou un cabinet de communication.
Introduction

From “What we heard”, © RCPSC, 2014
Introduction

- CanMEDS 2015: name change for the role of Manager to Leader

- RCPSC has used multiple methods of stakeholder engagement

- The hashtag #MgrLeadDebate was created to promote online discussion on Twitter regarding the name change
Background

• Twitter and healthcare
  » CME/FOAMed
  » Advocacy
  » Consultation
  » Networking

• Textual analysis and healthcare
  » Websites
  » Pharmaceutical advertisements
Dr Jason Frank Retweeted
Sally Davies @sallydavies27 · Oct 17
All doctors in training vital to future of NHS. Important that #juniorcontract does not penalise any particular groups. @medicalwomanuk

NEJM @NEJM · 33m
RT @Physiols1stWatch: How dietary #supplement complications present in the emergency department. jw.at/1k5VmyM Coverage of @NEJM

Brent Thoma Retweeted
Andywebster @Andywebster · 38m
@TChanMD @GiroAHA @BoringEM am I an innovator or early adopter for never having used vasoressin then?

Dr. Brian Goldman @NightShiftMD · 37m
Conrad Black: Harper did many great things for this country but hung on to power a little too long. natpo.et/1OKGAo9 So many gems.

Kevin Imrie @kimlr · 37m
Very interesting study!

Nomar Alviar @HPEducatorPH
Evidence-based cheating: The impact of simulated security breaches on OSCE performance wp.me/p3Z5xC-6v via @RC_ICRE_GIFR

Rick Bukata @emstracts · Jul 27
EM & Acute Care 2016 Registration Now Open! Cutting Edge Emergency Medicine in Amazing Locations. cards.twitter.com/cards/18ce5Sy8…

Promoted

Daniel Cabrera Retweeted
Damian Baalmann @dball86 · 15h
Purpose

• To explore **themes** that emerged from the twitter discussion of the name change “Manager to Leader”, using **textual analysis of tweets** incorporating #MgrLeadDebate

• To consider how these themes were reflected in relevant CanMEDS 2015 Royal College documents
Methods

• Document sources and sampling strategy
• Textual thematic analysis
• Coding of tweets using NVivo
• Coding of RCPSC documents
  » Each author independently coded the textual sources
  » Authors met to discuss coding and to resolve differences
  » Major themes were identified and discussed
Dr Jason Frank Retweeted

Ming-Ka Chan @MKChan_RCPSC · 30 May 2014
1+ MT "@dfrjfrank @TChanMD @Stevoeph Mgr & Ldr are all part of a construct. Could be sliced & organized several ways..." #mgrleaddebate

ICRE 2015 and 1 other Retweeted

Ming-Ka Chan @MKChan_RCPSC · 28 May 2014
@Stevoeph @TChanMD @dfrjfrank @BrentThoma Gr8 feedback for #mgrleaddebate and #CanMeds2015. Overlap of competencies inherent for sure.

Ming-Ka Chan Retweeted

Lisa Fields @PracticalWisdom · 19 Apr 2014
MT @ARJalal @dfrjfrank Manager Vs Leader #CanMeds2015 via @dfrjfrank #MgrLeadDebate #HCLDR

---

Manager

- Emphasis on healthcare system participation
- Stewardship
- "Not at the top"

Leader

- Emphasis on shaping the healthcare system
- Leading change
- "Leadership, not the boss"

---

Ming-Ka Chan @MKChan_RCPSC · 28 Mar 2014
@AImPardhan @dfrjfrank @Royal_College Sign up as epanel member or answer canmeds2016 survey to comment further on #mgrleaddebate

Kaif Pardhan @kaipardhan · 28 Mar 2014
@TChanMD @dfrjfrank @MKChan_RCPSC Evaluating/remediating "leader"; +/+challenging whether milestone based or current ITER #mgrleaddebate

Vishal Varshney and 14 others follow

Kaif Pardhan @kaipardhan · 28 Mar 2014
@TChanMD @dfrjfrank @MKChan_RCPSC Most "leader" competencies listed R good ones. Leader just may not be the best title #mgrleaddebate (2/2)
Results

• Relevant tweets identified from September 15, 2013 to May 30, 2014
• Number of unique tweets from conversations incorporating #MgrLeadDebate: 132
• Number of participants in the twitter conversation: 36
  » 33 individuals
  » 3 institutions
• 5 Themes emerged from analysis
Controversial nature of name change

- “Begs the question - don't we need CanMEDS to be both about Mgr AND Ldr??”
  » Twitter User 14, MD

- “Is leadership mandatory in all spec[ialties]? Manager is.”
  » Twitter User 11, MD

- “To manage is not per se leading; leading is managing and more”
  » Twitter User 5, MD

- “To properly emphasize leadership, the EWG also recommended a controversial proposal to change the title of the Role from Manager to Leader...The feedback, though mixed, highlighted a need to establish a common understanding of what it means to be a leader in today’s health care environment.”
  » Manager to Leader Report
Composite nature of leader role

• “Still misses the conceptualization of Leadership being a combinatory competency. You can't just LEAD”
  » Twitter User 14, MD

• “#leadership needed in all #CanMEDS Roles; its milestones may span across multiple Roles”
  » Twitter User 4, MD, RC affiliate

• “[The role] exists in conjunction with the Collaborator Role, which emphasizes shared leadership and thoughtful allocation of duties and responsibilities.”
  » Manager to Leader Report
Engagement

• “#Canmeds2015 views #mgrleaddebate as engagement, responsibility & active participation as follower or leader in collab with others”
  » Twitter User 4, MD, RC affiliate

• “Engage = lead or follow=start a movement”
  » Twitter User 5, MD

• “Governing bodies are calling for greater physician engagement and involvement: they are looking to physicians for advice, leadership and advocacy in health care.”
  » Manager to Leader Report

• “Although diverse opinions were expressed, common ground was found with regard to the need for physicians’ personal responsibility, active engagement, and contribution (as ways of conceptualizing leadership).”
  » EWG Report
Followership

• “Good followership IS a leadership competency…”
  » Twitter User 11, MD

• “Strong leaders know when to play second fiddle”
  » Twitter User 18, MD

• “The Role [of Leader] includes serving others and practising followership—lending meaningful support to other people when they are leading.”
  » Manager to Leader Report
Leadership, power and hierarchy

• “Those w/no "Official Leadership" Responsibilities can be the best Leaders”
  » Twitter User 2

• “#Leadership has many definitions, & that is muddying the debate for #CanMEDS2015.”
  » Twitter User 3, MD, RC affiliate

• “Those who name gain power over what's named”
  » Twitter User 26, MD

• “The change in the Role’s title from Manager to Leader may cause some people to worry that physicians are attempting to regain their historical dominance in health care.”
  » Manager to Leader Report
Limitations

• Twitter is only ONE consultative source in CanMEDS 2015

• Tweets are 140 character “snippets” of thought

• Conversations not incorporating #MgrLeadDebate not captured

• Relatively small number of participants in debate
Conclusions

• Textual thematic analysis may be used for a variety of written sources, including electronic or digital text

• Themes that emerged from analysis of tweets were reflected to some extent in each of the three relevant RC documents
  » Controversial nature of name change
  » Composite nature of leader role
  » Engagement
  » Followership
  » Leadership, power and hierarchy

• More nuanced discussion of name change found in supporting RC documents; CanMEDS 2015 Series IV itself focused more on outlining competencies of the leader role
Acknowledgements

- Dr. Teresa Chan
- Shea Coburn
- Dr. Jocelyn Lockyer
- Ann Toohey
References

- Collier, R. Doctors vs. governments: taking the fight online. CMAJ. 2015;187(6):393-394.
Help us improve. Your input matters.

• Download the ICRE App,

• Visit the evaluation area in the West Ballroom Foyer, near Registration, or

• Go to: http://www.royalcollege.ca/icreevaluations to complete the session evaluation.

You could be entered to win 1 of 3 $100 gift cards.

Aidons-nous à nous améliorer. Votre opinion compte.

• Téléchargez l’application de la CIFR

• Visitez la zone d’évaluation, foyer de la salle de bal Ouest, près du comptoir d’inscription, ou

• Visitez le http://www.collegeroyal.ca/evaluationscifr afin de remplir une évaluation de la séance.

Vous courrez la chance de gagner l’un des trois chèques-cadeaux d’une valeur de 100 $.