Remediation of residents in difficulty: a retrospective 10-year review of the experience of a Postgraduate Board of Examiners

The International Conference on Residency Education

I. Zbieranowski, S. Glover Takahashi, S. Spadafora

September 2011
Objective

- Systematic qualitative analysis of residents in difficulty at the University of Toronto
- 74 residency training programs
- Cases referred to Board of Examiners – Postgraduate Programs
- 10 year period (1999-2009)
Board of Examiners – Postgraduate Programs
• Established at University of Toronto 1995

Membership:
• Chair (elected by Faculty Council)
• Faculty members (9)
• Postgraduate trainees (3)
• Vice Dean PG programs (ex officio)

Recommendations:
• Remediation
• Remediation with probation
• Probation
• Dismissal
Overview of Study

- Prevalence
- Demographics of cases
- Board of Examiner decisions
- Remediation interventions
- Areas of weakness (CanMEDS roles)
- Resident outcomes
- Trends
Methods

- Comprehensive documentary analysis:
  - BOE resident files
  - BOE meeting minutes
  - BOE recommendations
Department of Trainees

Number of Trainees N = 100

Anaesthesia (n=6) 2%
Family Medicine (n=29) 3%
Medicine* (n=19) 2%
Obstetrics Gynaecology (n=4) 3%
Psychiatry (n=7) 2%
Surgery* (n=26) 4%
Other* (n=9) 2%

ONLY INCLUDES:


SURGERY: Cardiac, General, Neurosurgery, Orthopaedic, Plastic, Thoracic, Urology, Vascular

OTHER: Anat Pathology, Community Med, Med Biochemistry, Ophthalmology, Radiation Oncology, Diagnostic Radiology, Infectious Diseases – P, Rheumatology - P
Trainees at BOE over 10 years

Number of Trainees N = 100
Count (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th># of Trainees</th>
<th>Count (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1999-00</td>
<td>6 (0.5%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000-01</td>
<td>2 (0.2%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-02</td>
<td>6 (0.5%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002-03</td>
<td>7 (0.6%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003-04</td>
<td>8 (0.6%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-05</td>
<td>14 (1.0%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005-06</td>
<td>13 (0.9%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006-07</td>
<td>13 (0.9%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007-08</td>
<td>23 (1.5%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008-09</td>
<td>8 (0.5%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Type of Trainees

Number of Trainees N = 100

- Pool "A" MOH CMG: 55%
- Pool "B" MOH IMG: 22%
- Pool "C" Visa/Other: 23%

Postgraduate Medical Education
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
Level of Trainees

Level when first referred to BOE

- PGY 1: 26%
- PGY 2: 18%
- PGY 3: 14%
- PGY 4: 17%
- PGY 5: 25%
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>PGY1</th>
<th>PGY2</th>
<th>PGY3</th>
<th>PGY4</th>
<th>PGY5+</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anaesthesia</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Medicine</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2*</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medicine</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ob/Gyn</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychiatry</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surgery</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>26</strong></td>
<td><strong>18</strong></td>
<td><strong>14</strong></td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
<td><strong>25</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Family Medicine: Enhanced Skills*
BOE Decisions

Percentage of Residents (N=100)

- Remediation: 79%
- Remediation with probation: 15%
- Probation: 6%
Remediation Episodes

Number of total cases N=100

- **Once** (i.e., new1 only): 32%
- **Extended** (i.e., new1 + extension): 15%
- **Multiple Episodes** (i.e., new1, new2 etc.): 53%
# Lengths of Remediation and/or Probation

Total Number of Episodes N = 116

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Shortest (mos)</th>
<th>Longest (mos)</th>
<th>Mean (mos)</th>
<th>Mode (mos)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Remediation only (N=91)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Remediation &amp; Probation (N=18)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3, 6, 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Probation only (N=7)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>52*</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*remainder of residency
Problem Types

Percentage of Problem Types (N=100)

- Medical expert (n=85) 85%
- Professional (n=51) 51%
- Communicator (n=49) 49%
- Manager (n=43) 43%
- Collaborator (n=20) 20%
- Scholar (n=11) 11%
- Advocate (n=2) 2%

Average Number of Problem Types per Trainee = 2.6
# Outcome

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Remediation Outcome</th>
<th>Trainees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>COMPLETED</strong></td>
<td><strong>78</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Original program at U of T</td>
<td><strong>76</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transferred program at U of T</td>
<td><strong>2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ONGOING</strong></td>
<td><strong>5</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Original program at U of T</td>
<td><strong>3</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transferred programs at U of T</td>
<td><strong>2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DID NOT COMPLETE</strong></td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dismissed</td>
<td><strong>4</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Withdrawal</td>
<td><strong>13</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL CASES</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Next Steps

- Further trend analysis
- Subgroup analysis
- Impact on programs
Thank you!

Questions?

Dr. Ingrid Zbieranowski
Dr. Susan Glover Takahashi
Dr. Salvatore Spadafora