Like Begets Like:
How the Diversity of Faculty within Surgery Training Programs Can Impact which Applicants are Invited for Interviews

Aimee K. Gardner, PhD
Assistant Dean, Associate Professor
Baylor College of Medicine
Co-Founder, SurgWise Consulting

September 28, 2019
Disclosures

SurgWise Consulting
I AM MY OWN FAVORITE PERSON
"We need more people like you in our organization!"
Social Identity Theory  
(Tajfel, 1978) 

Two principles: 
1. We attain self-esteem from groups to which we belong. 
2. We are motivated to see our ingroups in the most favorable light possible. 

Result = 
Bias in favor of our ingroup
Ingroup Biases

- Attribution judgments (Brewer & Brown, 1998)
- Allocation of rewards to team members (Ng, 1981)
- Leadership appointments (Westphal & Zajac, 1995)
- Differential mentoring activities (Brewer, 1996)
- Employment interviews (McFarland et al., 2004)

“For some reason, the ones that look like me just really seem to deserve this.”
Social Identity = Homophily Network

- Similarity breeds connection
- Creates homogenous networks
- Limits social worlds
  - Information we receive
  - Attitudes we form
  - Interactions we experience

@AimeeGthePHD

McPherson et al. 2001
Situational Judgment Test (SJT) Research

Situational Judgment Test Background

The American healthcare system has changed. Medicine in the 21st century is team-based; it requires a collaborative approach to health care in a system that meets the access, safety and quality needs of all patients. Physicians need awareness and appreciation of socio-cultural issues that affect interactions with a more diverse set of colleagues and patients. Accordingly, medical students need to demonstrate both academic and pre-professional competencies to be successful in medical school, in residency training, and as physicians. In addition to students who are academically prepared, we need to select those who have strong professional and interpersonal skills necessary to develop clinical skills.

The AAMC developed a situational judgment test (SJT) to enhance the medical school admissions process by providing reliable information about students' performance under simulated patient scenarios.
Research Question

How might the diversity of individuals involved in the creation of situational judgment tests impact the demographic composition of candidates recommended by the test?
Methods

• On-site interviews
  • 12-15 Subject Matter Experts (SMEs)
  • Critical incident technique
• Quantitative assessments
• Review of historical documentation

• Identify competencies required & valued among entering residents
  • Current importance
  • Future importance
  • Frequency
  • Required upon entry
Methods

• Develop customized Situational Judgment Tests (SJT(s))
  • Iterative process of SME review & consensus
  • Unique program scoring algorithms

• Pilot to general surgery applicants in the 2018-2019 application cycle

• Compare demographic composition of SMEs and high-performing candidates
  • Gender
  • Race
Results

- 7 general surgery residency programs across 4 states in the U.S.
  - 98 SMEs interviewed
  - 14 (± 2.5) SMEs per program
- Pilot assessment completed by 2742 applicants
$R = 0.31$, ns
Conclusions

• Need some diversity to create diversity
• Intentional inclusion for individuals informing new assessment technique or process
• Perform sensitivity reviews
• Pilot and measure impact on candidate ratings
Deep Listening Dialogues for Inclusion and Transformation in Health Care

ICRE 2019 Opening Plenary
Dr. Lisa Richardson
Like Begets Like:
How the Diversity of Faculty within Surgery Training Programs Can Impact which Applicants are Invited for Interviews

Aimee K. Gardner, PhD
Assistant Dean, Associate Professor
Baylor College of Medicine
Co-Founder, SurgWise Consulting

aimee@surgwise.com