I do not have an affiliation (financial or otherwise) with a pharmaceutical, medical device or communications organization.

Je n’ai aucune affiliation (financière ou autre) avec une entreprise pharmaceutique, un fabricant d’appareils médicaux ou un cabinet de communication.
“Every truth has two sides; it is as well to look at both, before we commit ourselves to either” (Aesop, Thomas James, 1866)
Introduction

• Literature on PGME Selection and Admission
  > **Much research** has been done on the psychometric aspects of the process
  > **Few studies** on the perspectives of Program Directors on the process
  > **No studies** on the perspectives/experiences of residents on the process
Background

- To properly understand the true nature of the opinions that are being held by the various groups it is necessary to address the “rumour mills” that are the common source of student information (Ginsburg, Schreiber, Regehr, 2003).
- There is a general understanding that there is a ‘misunderstanding’ regarding variables that are valued in the match (Blissett et al., 2011; Watts et al., 2011; Lau et al., 2015).
Objective

• To understand the PGME selection and admission process from the perspectives of:
  > PGME Selection Committees (Faculty, Staff, resident members)
  > Residents
Conceptual Framework
Research Questions

• How do PGME selection and admission committees make selection and admission decisions?
• How do residents believe those decisions are made?
Methods

• Setting: University of Toronto
  > 2 Residency Programs
  > 14 Faculty Members PDs, Staff & Lead Administrators
  > 8 Residents

• Exploratory, qualitative, semi-structured, one-on-one interviews

• Analysis:
  > Coding
  > Thematic Analysis
## Results

### Theme 1: Most desired candidate qualities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selection Committee</th>
<th>Residents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enthusiastic</td>
<td>Motivated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work-life balance</td>
<td>Leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open</td>
<td>Altruistic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Results

### Theme 2: Selection Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selection Committee</th>
<th>Residents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multi-mini-interview</td>
<td>One-on-one interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Statement</td>
<td>Reference Letters</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results

Theme 3: Influences on Decision-Making

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selection Committee</th>
<th>Residents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Group synergy</td>
<td>vs Individual Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commitment to the specialty</td>
<td>Working with the ‘celebrity’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breadth and depth</td>
<td>Depth</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Results

### Theme 4: Vulnerabilities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selection Committee</th>
<th>Residents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training</td>
<td>'Timing’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatigue</td>
<td>Career choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choosing the wrong residents</td>
<td>Mixed messages</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discussion

- How can programs make applicants feel safe sharing their vulnerabilities when the ‘task’ is an exercise demonstrating the opposite?
- The Clerkship years is truly the ‘on-going interview’
- SO many subjective variables that go into that moment in time
Conclusions

• Create awareness to selection committee members on:
  • The powerful influence that their own experiences, values and beliefs have on the process.
  • the importance of the resident perspective when modifying or changing selection and admission processes in your program

• Create ongoing awareness to applicants on:
  > The importance of being confident in their abilities and highlighting their experiences that have gotten them ‘this far’ along in the process
Limitations

- Generalizing results across disciplines
- Recall bias
- Reluctance of truth telling
QUESTIONS???
Help us improve. Your input matters.

• Download the ICRE App, or
• Go to: www.royalcollege.ca/icre-evaluations to complete the session evaluation.

Aidez-nous à nous améliorer. Votre opinion compte!

• Téléchargez l’application de la CIFR
• Visitez le www.collegeroyal.ca/evaluationscifr afin de remplir une évaluation de la séance.

You could be entered to win one complimentary registration for ICRE 2020 in Vancouver. Vous pourriez participer au tirage d’une inscription gratuite à la CIFR 2020 à Vancouver.